

EVIDENCE ANALYSIS: WHICH IS THE “RIGHT” RECORD?

Rhoda Miller, Ed.D., CG® ~ rhodamiller104@gmail.com

Evaluation of Evidence

In the presence of conflicting facts, the following three criteria are used to evaluate each piece of evidence. Careful analysis reveals there are nuances and circumstances of these terms. An understanding of these terms leads to effective decision-making.

- Source – Is it original, derivative or authored?
- Information – Is it primary, secondary or unknown?
- Evidence – Is it direct, indirect or negative?

Genealogical Proof Standard (GPS)

Using this series of steps, one can come to a logical conclusion determining the veracity of a fact:

- A reasonably exhaustive search for all information related to the fact in question.
- Citation of all sources related to the fact in question.
- Evidence analysis based upon the criteria described above.
- Resolve conflicting facts.
- Arrive at a reasonably sound and written conclusion.

Bibliography

Board for Certification of Genealogists. The Genealogical Proof Standard.

<http://www.bcgcertification.org/resources/standard.html> Retrieved October 26, 2016.

Evidence Analysis & Evaluation – Genealogical Proof Standards. Cydislist.com.

<http://www.cyndislist.com/evidence/gps/> Retrieved October 26, 2016.

Jones, T. W. (2013). *Mastering Genealogical Proof*. Arlington, VA: NGS Press.

Mills, E. S. (2007) *Evidence Explained: Citing History Sources from Artifacts to Cyberspace*
Baltimore: Genealogical Publishing Co.

Mills, E.S. (2007). *QuickSheet: Citing Online Historical Resources Evidence! Style* (rev.)
Baltimore: Genealogical Publishing Co.

Rose, Christine (2009). *Genealogical Proof Standard: Building a Solid Case*, 3rd edition. San Jose, CA: CR Publications.